

### INTRODUCTION TO LEGAL REASONINGS

John Swan
Robert J. Sharpe
John B. Laskin
Arnold S. Weinrib
Barry J. Reiter
Katherine E. Swinton

1979-1980

LAW LIBRARY

OCT 2 9 1979

FACULTY OF LAW UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

## Table of Contents

### INTRODUCTION TO LEGAL REASONING

| PART 1. | HISTORICAL BACKGROUND  | 1  |
|---------|--|----|
|         | J.W. Gough, Fundamental Law in English<br>Constitutional History | 2  |
|         | Magna Carta, 1297  | 3  |
|         | Dr. Bonham's Case  | 10 |
|         | Calvin's Case  | 12 |
|         | Note on the Petition of Right 1628                               | 14 |
|         | Petition of Right, 1628  | 16 |
|         | The Bill of Rights 1688  | 19 |
|         | Blackstone, Commentaries on the Laws of England (1765)           | 25 |
|         | Bracton, On the Laws and Customs of England                      | 29 |

### PART II. WHY DO COURTS GIVE REASONS?

| (a) Reasons and Stare Decisis   | 30  |
|---|-----|
| Fuller, The Morality of Law   | 30  |
| Moore v. The Queen  | 74  |
| Re B and Commission of Inquiry re Department of Manpower and Immigration                  | 85  |
| Hauck v. Dixon  | 90  |
| Hart and Sacks, The Legal Process: Basic<br>Problems in the Making and Application of Law | 95  |
| (b) Prospective Overraling  |     |
| Practice Statement (Judicial Precedent)   | 97  |
| Hedley Byrne & Co. Ltd. v. Heller & Partners Ltd.   | 98  |
| A.V.G. Management Science Ltd. v. Barwell Developments Ltd.                               | 115 |
| (c) Retrospective Overruling  |     |
| Miliangos v. George Frank Textiles Ltd.   | 126 |
| Lim v. Camden Health Authority  | 136 |
|   |     |
| (d) <u>Dissents</u>   |     |
| International News Service v. The Associated Press  | 149 |

# PART III. WHEN SHOULD A COURT RECOGNIZE A NEW CAUSI OF ACTION?

| Fleming v. Atkinson  | 162 |
|--|-----|
| Kungl v. Schiefer  | 173 |
| Hart and Sacks, The Legal Process: Basic<br>Problems in the Making and Application of<br>Law                                       | 180 |
| Roberson v. Rochester Folding Box Co.  | 184 |
| Background Notes on Judicial Enforcment<br>of Primary Obligations not Previously<br>Recognized as Enforceable Legal<br>Obligations | 196 |
| Digitized by the Internet Archive  | 204 |
| Malorin 2018 with funding from Metropolis (No. 2) University of Toronto  | 219 |
| Assignment for Seminar Discussion  | 230 |
| Whittaker v. Sanders   | 231 |
| Alexander, The Family and the Law of Torts   | 233 |

#### PART IV. WHEN SHOULD A COURT DEFER TO LEGISLATION?

| Harrison v. Carswell                                 | 245 |
|--|-----|
| The Petty Trespasses Act                             | 257 |
| P. Weiler, Legal Values and Judicial Decision-Making | 258 |
| Devlin, Judges and Law Makers                        | 262 |
| L. Fuller Anatomy of the Law                         | 265 |